

AVA 3 MODEL: SUPPORTING INDICATORS FOR EVALUATION

Approved by Governing Board Resolution no. 3 of 12 January 2023

Evaluation domain A - STRATEGY, PLANNING AND ORGANISATION

| Code | Point of Attention | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| A.1 | Quality of teaching, research, third mission/social impact and quality of institutional and management activities within the university's policies and strategies | Consistency and integration of strategic and performance planning. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| A.2 | Organisation of the university governance system and Quality Assurance system | Availability and coverage of the management control system. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| A.3 | Monitoring system of policies, strategies, processes, and results | Availability of a system to monitor the planning of activities and results achieved, supported by a structured set of indicators for performance measurement. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| A.4 | Review of the university Quality Assurance system and governance system | Regularity and effectiveness of the review of the organisation and Quality Assurance system. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| A.5 | Role of the students | Presence of concrete measures aimed at enhancing student representation, according to the provisions of Law no. 240/2010 (art. 2, paragraph 2, letter i). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |

Evaluation domain B - RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

| Code | Point of Attention | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|-------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| B.1.1 | Recruitment, qualification and management of teaching and research staff | Percentage of full and associate professors recruited in the previous three years (and not already faculty members) out of the total number of professors recruited. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | PROPER Web Portal |
| | | Adequacy and amount of training and refresher courses for the teaching staff (number of hours of training by type of training activity, related to the different roles), with special regard to teaching quality and innovation (e.g., teaching and assessment methods, Distance Teaching and Learning [DTL]). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis + on-site visit Good Practice Project (for universities involved) |
| | | Positioning of the university in terms of quality of the teacher recruitment policies. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | Indicator R2 VQR 15-19 |
| B.1.2 | Recruitment, qualification, and management of technical-administrative staff | Adequacy and amount of the training and refresher courses for the technical-administrative staff (number of hours of training per type of training activity related to the number of employees), with special regard to quality, management control, organisation by processes, transversal skills. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis + on-site visit Good Practice Project (for universities involved) |
| | | Relationship between resources for Technical, Administrative and Library staff (<i>Personale Tecnico, Amministrativo e Bibliotecario</i> = TAB) training and number of TAB staff. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | University financial statement PROPER Web Portal |
| B.1.3 | Human resources and services supporting administration, teaching, research and third mission/social impact | TAB staff distribution in terms of Full Time Equivalent (FTE), in the various administrative areas | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | University Data Good Practice Project (for universities involved) |
| B.2.1 | Financial resources: Planning and management | Value and development of ministerial indicators (personnel costs, indebtedness, financial sustainability). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | PROPER Web Portal Indicators tab - University (only State Universities - University Data for non-State Universities) |

| Code | Point of Attention | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|-------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| B.3.1 | Building structures and infrastructures: planning and management | Presence of updated documents regarding owned, held or leased real estate (Legislative Decree no. 33/2013, art. 30), of the public works three-year programme, along with the list of works to be carried out during the reference year and the plan of property transfers and investments (Legislative Decree no. 50/2016, art. 21). | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis |
| B.3.2 | Adequacy of building structures and infrastructure for teaching, research and third mission/social impact activities | Available spaces (sqm) for teaching and research activities in relation to the number of students enrolled within 1 year beyond the regular period of the programmes and of university professors. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | PRO3 University Data Desk analysis for sqm estimate. ANS (Student National Register) for students Number of tenured professors Ministry of University and Research (MUR) - building survey |
| B.4.1 | Equipment and technology: planning and management | Presence of a university planning document on equipment management. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis |
| B.4.2 | Adequacy of equipment and technology | Coverage level of classrooms with Wi-Fi system. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis |
| B.4.3 | Support facilities and services for (full or partial) distance teaching | Level of adequacy and functionality of the technological facilities for Distance Teaching and Learning (DTL). | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| B.5.1 | Management of information and knowledge | Presence of a university planning document on information and knowledge management. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis |

Evaluation domain C - QUALITY ASSURANCE

| Code | Point of Attention | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| C.1 | Self-assessment, external assessment and review of study programmes, PhD programmes and Departments with the support of the University Quality Committee | Regularity of the Cyclical Review of study programmes and of research and third mission by the Departments. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Qualitative | Desk analysis |
| | | Percentage of study programmes for which the student opinion survey was carried out. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis |
| C.2 | Monitoring system of the university Quality Assurance system | Level of effectiveness of the QA system improvement actions implemented annually by the University Quality Committee. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| | | Level of effectiveness of the improvement actions implemented by the study programmes following the compilation of the annual monitoring form (<i>Scheda di monitoraggio annuale</i> = SMA). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| C.3 | Evaluation of the Quality Assurance system and processes of teaching, research and third mission/social impact by the University Evaluation Board | Number of auditions of study programmes and Departments annually held by the University Evaluation Board and involving active study programmes and existing Departments. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University Data Desk analysis + on-site visit |

Evaluation domain D - QUALITY OF TEACHING AND SERVICES FOR STUDENTS

| Code | Attention points | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|
| D.1 | Planning of the Study offer | Percentage of active study programmes meeting the teaching requirements under current legislation. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | Study offer database |
| | | Number of courses delivered in foreign languages out of the total of courses in the academic year ("PRO3"). | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | PRO 3 and Study offer database |
| D.2 | Design and update of student-focused study programmes and PhDs | Percentage of university credits (<i>Crediti Formativi Universitari</i> = CFU) achieved during the first year out of the number of credits to be achieved. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Annual Monitoring Form (<i>Scheda di Monitoraggio Annuale</i> = SMA) |
| | | Percentage of teaching hours delivered by permanent professors out of the total teaching hours delivered. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| | | Percentage of tenured professors appointed as reference professors belonging to basic and characterizing academic disciplines (<i>settori scientifico-disciplinari</i> = SSD) in the active study programmes (Bachelor degrees, Master degrees, Single cycle master degree programmes). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| D.3 | Admission and students' career | Percentage of students who continue to the second year in the same degree class having acquired during the first year at least 2/3 of the expected University credits. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| | | Percentage of graduates (Bachelor degrees, Master degrees, Single cycle master degree programmes), within the regular period and within one year beyond the regular period of the programme respectively. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| | | Proportion of university credits acquired by students abroad (including university credits acquired during "virtual mobility" periods). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| | | Percentage of graduates overall satisfied with the Study Programme. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| | | Percentage of employed graduates one and three years after graduation (Master and Single cycle master degree programmes) (divided by medical-health area, scientific-technological area and Humanities and Social area). | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |

Evaluation domain E - QUALITY OF RESEARCH AND THIRD MISSION/SOCIAL IMPACT

| Code | Point of Attention | Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| E.1 | Definition of Department strategies | Presence of a monitoring report on the level of definition of departmental strategies. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis + on-site visit |
| E.2 | Evaluation of the results achieved by Departments and PhD programmes and of improvement actions | Proceeds from commissioned research, technology transfer and competitive funding compared to the number of the university's permanent professors. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University budget + PROPER Web Portal |
| | | Number of university spin-offs and patents (registered and approved at national and European level), compared to the number of the university's permanent professors. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Desk analysis University Data SUA RD - TM |
| | | Number of third mission activities compared to the number of the university's permanent professors. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Desk analysis University Data SUA RD - TM |
| E.3 | Definition and publicity of resource distribution criteria | Resources available from the Award Fund compared to the total cost of university staff. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • University Data • PROPER Web Portal |

STUDY PROGRAMMES

| Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Percentage of graduates (Bachelor degrees, Master degrees, Single cycle master degree programmes) within the regular period of the programme | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Annual Monitoring Form (<i>Scheda di Monitoraggio Annuale = SMA</i>) |
| Percentage of university credits achieved in the first year out of the number of credits to be achieved | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students continuing in the second year of the same study programme | AVA 3 – ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students continuing in the second year of the same study programme having acquired at least 2/3 of the University credits expected for the first year | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of enrolled students (Bachelor degrees, Master degrees, Single cycle master degree programmes) graduating within a year beyond the regular period of the programme, in the same study programme | AVA 3 – ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of teaching hours delivered by permanent professors out of the total teaching hours delivered | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students enrolled (Bachelor degrees, Master degrees, Single cycle master degree programmes) graduating, in the programme, within its regular period | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Students/professors ratio (weighted for teaching hours) | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| First-time ever enrolled students/first year teachers (weighted for teaching hours) | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of inactive enrolled students* | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of inactive or unproductive enrolled students* | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |

*full or partial distance-learning study programmes

MEDICINE AND SURGERY STUDY PROGRAMMES

| Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ Quantitative | Data source |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Percentage of graduates (Single cycle master degree programmes) within the regular period of the programme | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Annual Monitoring Form (<i>Scheda di Monitoraggio Annuale = SMA</i>) |
| Percentage of university credits achieved in the first year out of the number of credits to be achieved | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students continuing in the second year of the same study programme | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students continuing in the second year of the same study programme having acquired at least 2/3 of the University credits expected for the first year | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of enrolled students (Single cycle master degree programmes) graduating within one year after the regular period of the Programme, in the same study programme | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of teaching hours delivered by permanent professors out of the total teaching hours delivered | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | SMA |
| Percentage of students enrolled (Single cycle master degree programmes) graduating, in the Programme, within its regular period | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Students/professors ratio (weighted for teaching hours) | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| First-year enrolled students/first-year course professors' ratio (weighted for teaching hours) | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | SMA |
| Ratio between the average score obtained in the admission test to the speciality medical School by students who graduated in the study programme in the same year of the test or in the previous year, and the average national score obtained in the test by all students graduated in a Medicine and Surgery Study Programme in the same year of the test or in the previous year. | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | Ministry of University and Research (MUR) |
| Number of admissions* in the reference Hospital/First-year enrolled students*** | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | ANS (Student National Register) AGENAS (National Agency for Regional Health Services) University Data |
| Number of admissions for specialist visits *** in the reference Hospital/First-year enrolled students*** | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | ANS (Student National Register) AGENAS (National Agency for Regional Health Services) University Data |
| Number of DRG* (Diagnosis Related Groups) types presented at least 10 times | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | AGENAS (National Agency for Regional Health Services) University Data |

* By "admissions" we refer to the total of ordinary admissions + day hospital admissions. For DRG ordinary + day hospital admissions are considered

** By "first year enrolments" we refer to the total number (EU and non-EU) of positions for enrolment in the single cycle MD programme in Medicine and Surgery set annually by the Ministry of University and Research (MUR) for all Degree Programmes also from different Universities that share the same reference structure.

*** In calculating the number of admissions for specialist visits, codes starting with 90 and 91 (90.xx.xx and 91.xx.xx) - as defined in Annex 4, DPCM 12 January 2017 - should be excluded.

PHD PROGRAMMES

| Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ quantitative | Data source |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Percentage of first-time ever enrolled students of the PhD programmes graduated in another University* | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | ANS (Student National Register) - Post lauream |
| Percentage of PhD students who have spent at least three months abroad* | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | ANS (Student National Register) - Post lauream |
| Percentage of scholarships financed by external organisations* | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | PhD initial accreditation Form (Section C) |
| Percentage of PhD students who have spent at least six months of their training period in public or private institutions other than that running the PhD programme (months spent abroad included) * | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | ANS (Student National Register) - Post lauream |
| Ratio between number of research products authored by PhD students during the last three PhD cycles, and number of PhD student in the last three PhD cycles | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Quantitative | University Data (pending the PhD programmes Register, according to Ministerial Decree no. 226/2021) |
| Presence of a PhD student opinion survey system | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | University Data ALMALAUREA (for universities adhering to the PhD survey) |
| Use of PhD student opinions for the redesign/updating the PhD programme organisation | AVA 3 - ANVUR | Qualitative | Desk analysis + On-site visit |

* Referring to the last three completed cycles. Periods spent abroad may also be non-continuous.

DEPARTMENTS

| Indicator | Regulatory Reference | Qualitative/ quantitative | Data source |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Proceeds from commissioned research, technology transfer and competitive funding, compared to the number of Professors of the Department. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | University budget + PROPER Web Portal |
| Number of University spin-offs and patents (registered and approved at national and European level), compared to the number of Professors of the Department. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Desk analysis SUA RD – TM |
| Number of third mission activities, compared to the number of Professors of the Department. | Ministerial Decree no. 1154/2021 | Quantitative | Desk analysis SUA RD - TM |