ANVUR
Meeting of the Advisory Committee - 17 January 2017

REPORT (ENGLISH Version)

Agenda of the Meeting held on Tuesday, January 17, 2017 – 12:00 at ANVUR:

1. Communications
2. Homogeneous areas of assessment
3. VQR – final report and presentation of results
4. AVA 2.0 - final approval of the new Guidelines and next steps
5. TECO – working in progress
6. AFAM – working in progress
7. Work Plan of the Advisory Committee (art. 3 of the Functioning regulation of the Advisory Committee)

Attendees

| European Students’ Union / ESIB | Fernando Miguel Galan Palomares |
| Accademia dei Lincei | Renato Guarini |
| Consiglio Nazionale dell’Economia e del Lavoro | Costanzo Jannotti Pecci |
| Consiglio Universitario Nazionale | Alessandra Petrucci |
| Convegno permanente dei Direttori Amministrativi e dirigenti delle Università | Antonio Romeo |
| European Students’ Union / ESIB | Mattia Sguazzini |
| Consiglio Nazionale degli Studenti Universitari | Pietro De Ponti |
| Consiglio Nazionale degli Studenti Universitari | Mario Donadio |
| European Research Council | Belen Gavela |
| Consiglio Nazionale dell’Economia e del Lavoro | Maria Castriotta |

Connected via videoconference:

| European Research Council | Claudio Bordignon |

Apologies:

| European University Association | Rolf Tarrach |
| Segretario generale OCSE | Dirk Van Damme |
| Consiglio Nazionale dell’Economia e del Lavoro | Andrea Lapiccirella |
| Conferenza unificata Stato-regioni, città ed autonomie locali | Adriana Agrimi |
| Consiglio Nazionale degli Studenti Universitari | Nicola D’Ambrosio |

Absences:

| Consiglio Nazionale dell’Economia e del Lavoro | Delio Napoleone |
The participants are 10 plus one joining via videoconference, thus the quorum required is achieved and the meeting can start.

In addition to the President Graziosi, the councilors Rumiati and Terracini, the general manager Momigliano, the managers Malgarini and Ancaiani, and the collaborator Romagnosi attend the works on behalf of Anvur.

President Petrucci thanks all the attendees for the participation and presents the new representatives CNSU. Because of the commitments of the President and advisers ANVUR, Petrucci asks for change the agenda as follows:

1. Communications
2. AVA 2.0 - final approval of the new Guidelines and next steps
3. TECO – working in progress
4. Homogeneous areas of assessment
5. AFAM – working in progress
6. VQR – final report and presentation of results
7. Work Plan of the Advisory Committee (art. 3 of the Functioning regulation of the Advisory Committee).

The Committee agreed.

Petrucci informs that Communications concern the news in the financial act regarding Anvur and she leaves the floor to Graziosi who explains:

- Financial solidity;
- Growth of the staff;
- VQR with five year continuity;
- Agency’s role in the selection of departments for the allocation of extra funding;
- Definition of the criteria by ANVUR to select teachers and researchers to access to more funding.

Also, with another measure, to Anvur was entrusted the assessment the institutions not supervised by the Ministry of Education.

It then goes on to AVA and Terracini informs the Committee on the working progress. The Ministerial Decree (987/2016), which came out in December, has introduced some new features, such as:

- Clearer procedures for periodic accreditation of site and programs;
- News on the parameters and criteria, particularly on the minimum teaching requirements: for programs newly activated, the university shall to indicate all teachers full time and the number of reference teachers is calculated on the actual number of students enrolled.

Jannotti Pecci points out that Confindustria is raising the question of graduates from telematics universities, which they are candidates for profiles that are often not prepared. Graziosi replies that with this DM, the telematics should align with the general standards and the new rules require that in 2018/2019 three out of seven teacher will be hired indefinitely. Already this year the two telematics universities, that do not
meet the standards, should employ 100 professors or reduce the training offer. Ancaiani adds that this year ANVUR will close the periodic accreditation of telematics visits.

Also on the DM, Terracini informs that the experimental vocational degrees have been postponed one year and ANVUR will be expected to establish the evaluation criteria. Graziosi, in this regard, invites the Committee to deepen the professional tertiary education.

Petrucci lets Rumiati speak on the novelty on Teco, topic 3 of the agenda. One year ago the groups who have previously worked on Teco, were called in ANVUR and, on the basis of these meetings, it has been initiated, at five universities, a validation of tests carried out “in house” for two areas of skills (literacy and numeracy). Between February and March there will be a public meeting to present the results. Then the actual experimentation will start in ten universities. Regarding disciplinary skills, it is expected to begin to coordinate the work of the scientific community who have the material prepared, as in the case of health degrees, but also engineers, chemists and perhaps philosophers.

Petrucci calls for a deepening of Teco, as has been done for AVA, and Rumiati gives her availability for a meeting dedicated to the subject.

Galan asks if ANVUR is in contact with other similar international experiences to Teco, and Gavela asks if the incentives are provided for student participating in the project. Rumiati replies that the Teco’s framework is inspired also to the South America experiences, not only to European, and that the problem of incentives is very important; both issues will be discussed in detailed in the dedicated meeting.

Then Petrucci asks to Graziosi to introduce the homogeneous areas of assessment, topic 4 of the agenda. Graziosi reports that in very fragmented areas or forced to cohabitation, perceived as unjustified from a valuation perspective (Informatics, History of business economy), emerged the need for a recognition of the scientific community. Based on these external pressures, ANVUR would like to make a proposal to homogenize the subject areas, exclusively from a valuation point of view and proposes for the next VQR, 25-30 panels instead of 14 (16). Graziosi informs the Committee that some meetings with groups of Area 10 and 14 have already been made.

Gavela asks why increase the subject areas, the danger may be an excessive fragmentation. Graziosi explains that in Italy there are 14 areas, while in REF or ERC and in other European experiences there are many more areas, with which at present it is difficult confronted. In March ANVUR will make a proposal to be discussed with the community.

Sguazzini asks if the initiatives are planned with the CUN and MIUR and Graziosi replies that Anvur is ready to work with them but, however, the agency is required to perform the VQR and to make an assessment that takes into account of the specificity of some sectors.

About the point 5, Petrucci asks when the guidelines AFAM will be disseminated and Rumiati informs the Committee that the guidelines are being closed and will be approved by the Board. By the end of February/early March will be made public. Sguazzini asks whether the proceedings of these LG will be with public consultation, as for AVA. The procedure will be decided during the CD.

Graziosi apologizes, informs the Committee that leaves the sitting for a commitment and entrust Malgarini with illustrate the point 6, the working progress of the VQR. Also Terracini, Rumiati, Ancaiani and Momigliano come out.

Then Malgarini informs the Committee on working progress of the VQR. The results are published on website Anvur and the tables with disaggregated data will be presented on 21 February. A section on the third mission will also be in VQR report, in the structure reports and a report from the Commission’s third mission.

About the observation of De Ponti on the criticality of IRAS2, Malgarini says that, compared to the announcement, the calculations for IRAS2 were done on a slightly different definition, as indicated the
MIUR. The only calculation on the "heads" could be affected by the university recruitment constraints. An alternative version would be to weigh the overall workforce. Eventually the Ministry of Education has decided to regard the organic point. The data, however, will show this IRAS and the IRAS initially anticipated.

Sguazzini asks for information on the share of rewards planned for the departments, and in particular what are the selection criteria. Malgarini recalls that in the past has been done a work so-called "virtual department", with the CRUI. Probably this work will be taken up and revised, but when the VQR will be finished.

Malgarini leaves the meeting.

About the last point, since ANVUR gave a availability to deepen the issues relating to vocational degrees, Teco and AFAM, Petrucci asks to the Committee to have the mandate to organize specific meetings that will be agreed with ANVUR. The Committee decided to participate collectively and in an optional way.

Sguazzini asks to see the documents about homogeneous area and Teco; Galan asks the yearly report on Anvur’s activities and the new decrees on AVA. He also proposes to include the issue of accreditation ANVUR at ENQA in the next agenda. The Committee agreed.

The meeting closes at 2.30pm.

Roma, 27/01/2017