THE EVALUATION OF THE THIRD MISSION: THE CASE OF HEALTH RESEARCH

AESIS International Training Course
23 March 2018
Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche, Rome

Brigida Blasi,
Third Mission Evaluation Unit
ANVUR: origins & mission

‘90: autonomy (decentralization) & responsibility (system of evaluation) for universities

2010: introduction of an evaluation system based on an independent agency, institution of ANVUR

End of 2011: kick-start with the 7 members of the Advisory Board and 3 people as staff

Today: 18 people (35 by the end of 2018)
AVVIO PROCEDURA ACCREDITAMENTO ENQA

Pubblichiamo oggi (9 marzo 2018) il documento Terms of Reference, con il quale l'ANVUR avvia formalmente la procedura volta a conseguire l'accreditamento di Full Member Agency da parte dell'European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) e il contestuale inserimento nel registro europeo delle agenzie responsabili dei sistemi di...

APPROFONDISCI

AFAM
Alta Formazione Artistica, Musicale e Corallica

ASN
Abilitazione Scientifica Nazionale

AVA
Autovalutazione, Valutazione Periodica, Accreditamento

DIPARTIMENTI
Dipartimenti di Eccellenza

DOCTORI
Accreditamento e Valutazione Corsi di Dottorato

FFABR
Finanziamento delle Attività Base di Ricerca

PERFORMANCE
Valutazione Attività Amministrative

RAPPORTO BIENNALE
Rapporto sullo Stato del Sistema Universitario e della Ricerca

SPECIALIZZAZIONE
Scuole di Specializzazione

SUO
Schede Uniche Annuali

TERZA MISSIONE
Impatto Socio-economico della Ricerca

VQR
Valutazione della Qualità della Ricerca
ANVUR: origins & mission

- Administration
- Teaching
- Research
- Third Mission

universities

PROs
How to evaluate TM?
ONE FINAL INDICATOR FOR THIRD MISSION

VQR 2004-2010
- amounts of third party contracts
- number of granted patents owned by the university
- number of spin-out companies
- presence of incubators
- number of technology transfer consortia and associations
- number of archaeological excavations
- presence of museums
- number of other third mission activities

Group of experts (data, evaluation, indicators)

Two international workshops

VQR 2011-2014
- Set up of the TM Database and Information System
- Publication of ANVUR TM Evaluation Manual
- Broad definition of TM
- Informed peer review
- Institution of a TM Evaluation Panel

Consultation of the academic community

FINAL REPORT ON THIRD MISSION

New Group of Experts

Revision of the TM Information System

Revision of the TM Manual

2011 2018
Definition and perimeter

**DEF:** the openness of the University towards the socio-economic context through the valorization and transfer of knowledge
Definition and perimeter

**DEF:** the openness of the University towards the socio-economic context through the valorization and transfer of knowledge

what is there inside TM?
Definition and perimeter

**DEF:** the openness of the University towards the socio-economic context through the valorization and transfer of knowledge.

Not only technology transfer activities and valorization of research but also social and cultural benefits (public goods).
Definition and perimeter

valorization of research

activities aimed at the valorization of research, that is by definition the transformation of goods supported by public funding (public research) into private goods (economic and commercial applications):
Definition and perimeter

valorization of research

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

ACADEMIC SPIN-OUT COMPANIES

THIRD PARTY RESEARCH

INTERMEDIARIES
Definition and perimeter

valorization of research

production of public goods

activities which have spillovers on society at large, through the production of public goods that are made accessible to society:
Definition and perimeter

Valorization of research

- Intellectual Property
- Academic Spin-out Companies
- Third Party Research
- Intermediaries

Production of public goods

- Cultural Heritage
- Contribution to Public Health
- Lifelong Learning
- Public Engagement
Evaluation approach

• In VQR 2011-2014, TM and research performance has been assessed, but TM in a separate chapter and not inserted in the funding formula.

• Universities and PROs must have the autonomy to define the mix of activities according to their own history, competencies, interpretation of the needs of society, and strengths. So the institutions have been evaluated only if active in the eight areas (link to the institutional strategy).

• Evaluation is based on informed peer review (analysis of quantitative indicators through expert judgement): constitution of the TM evaluation panel in VQR.
Evaluation approach

• Evaluation is guided by ANVUR Manual which specifies for each area criteria, indicators & questions

• An informative system has been set up to collect standardized and comparable data related to all the universities and PROs

• To improving data quality and reducing burden & costs for institutions, some data are drawn directly from official databases, i.e. European Patent Office for patents, Chamber of Commerce for spin-out companies

• From this database, 90 TM indicators (normalization by discipline and size) have been produced and used by the VQR evaluation panel
Evaluation approach

- **Institutional** activities (not at an individual level)
- Within a research assessment exercise not focused on excellence but on quality: *systemic* picture (not case study)
- **Informed peer review** (different maturity stage of TM areas for measurement)
- **Assumption** (not demonstrated): interactions with the socio-economic context have societal impact
- Societal impact of research is **difficult to measure** and assessment is far from straightforward
Evaluation approach

- Payback model (Hanney et al 2004 in Donovan 2011)
The case of health research
### 0 - Strategic objectives of Third Mission & Societal Impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Valorization of the research</th>
<th>B. Production of Public Goods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - Intellectual property management (patents and plant varieties)</td>
<td>5 - Cultural goods and activities (archeological excavations, museums, music activities, historical buildings and archives, ancient libraries, theaters and sports facilities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - Academic spin-out companies</td>
<td>6 - Clinical activities for public health (clinical trials, non-interventional studies and patients empowerment initiatives, biobanks and other structures)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - Third party funding</td>
<td>7 - Continuing education and open education (continuing education courses, skills certification activities, Continuing Medical Education courses, MOOCs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 - Intermediaries (technology transfer offices, placement offices, incubators, science parks, consortia, poles and other TM intermediaries)</td>
<td>8 - Public engagement (non-profit activities organized by the institution or by its departments with educational, cultural and social value, e.g. production of advice, expertise, informed opinion, contributions to controversies, communication of science)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Revision of the information system

- Brand new sheet for data collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0 - Strategic objectives of Third Mission &amp; Societal Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Valorization of the research</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - Intellectual property management (patents and plant varieties)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - Academic spin-out companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - Third party funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 - Intermediaries (technology transfer offices, placement offices, incubators, science parks, consortia, poles and other TM intermediaries)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Revision of the information system

- **Brand new sheet for data collection**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>0 - Strategic objectives of Third Mission &amp; Societal Impact</strong></th>
<th><strong>A. Valorization of the research</strong></th>
<th><strong>B. Production of Public Goods</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1 - Intellectual property management</strong> (patents and plant varieties)</td>
<td><strong>5 - Cultural goods and activities</strong> (archaeological excavations, museums, music activities, historical buildings and archives, ancient libraries, theaters and sports facilities)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2 - Academic spin-out companies</strong></td>
<td><strong>6 - Clinical activities for public health</strong> (clinical trials, non-interventional studies and patients' empowerment initiatives, biobanks and other structures)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3 - Third party funding</strong></td>
<td><strong>7 - Continuing education and open education</strong> (continuing education courses, skills certification activities, Continuing Medical Education courses, MOOCs)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4 - Intermediaries</strong> (technology transfer offices, placement offices, incubators, science parks, consortia, poles and other TM intermediaries)</td>
<td><strong>8 - Public engagement</strong> (non-profit activities organized by the institution or by its departments with educational, cultural and social value, e.g. production of advice, expertise, informed opinion, contributions to controversies, communication of science)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Revision of the information system

• Brand new sheet for data collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0 - Strategic objectives of Third Mission &amp; Societal Impact</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Valorization of the research</strong></td>
<td><strong>B. Production of Public Goods</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - Intellectual property management (patents and plant varieties)</td>
<td>5 - Cultural goods and activities (archeological excavations, museums, music activities, historical buildings and archives, ancient libraries, theaters and sports facilities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - Academic spin-out companies</td>
<td>6 - Clinical activities for public health (clinical trials, non-interventional studies and patients' empowerment initiatives, biobanks and other structures)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - Third party funding</td>
<td>7 - Continuing education and open education (continuing education courses, skills certification activities, Continuing Medical Education courses, MOOCs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 - Intermediaries (technology transfer offices, placement offices, incubators, science parks, consortia, poles and other TM intermediaries)</td>
<td>8 - Public engagement (non-profit activities organized by the institution or by its departments with educational, cultural and social value, e.g. production of advice, expertise, informed opinion, contributions to controversies, communication of science)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Revision of the information system

- **Brand new sheet for data collection**

### 0 - Strategic objectives of Third Mission & Societal Impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Valorization of the research</th>
<th>B. Production of Public Goods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - Intellectual property management (patents and plant varieties)</td>
<td>5 - Cultural goods and activities (archeological excavations, museums, music activities, historical buildings and archives, ancient libraries, theaters and sports facilities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - Academic spin-out companies</td>
<td>6 - Clinical activities for public health (clinical trials, non-interventional studies and patients 'empowerment initiatives, biobanks and other structures)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - Third party funding</td>
<td>7 - Continuing education and open education (continuing education courses, skills certification activities, Continuing Medical Education courses, MOOCs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 - Intermediaries (technology transfer offices, placement offices, incubators, science parks, consortia, poles and other TM intermediaries)</td>
<td>8 - Public engagement (non-profit activities organized by the institution or by its departments with educational, cultural and social value, e.g. production of advice, expertise, informed opinion, contributions to controversies, communication of science)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Clinical activities for public health

• Economic impact (marketing of new drugs, ...), but also direct contribution to public health

• Non-profit experimentation has the same scientific relevance and organizational complexity as profit experimentation, but it is driven by the only clinical interest in improving the well-being and life expectancy of patients; it is often the only research activity aimed at rare, pediatric or other "neglected" and less profitable diseases

• Observational and epidemiological studies and patient empowerment activities, e.g. registers of patients or pathology or adverse events, are also important activities that see the patient as active and participant part in the decision-making processes of studies and trials

• Clinical facilities that support research have also a strong social value, e.g. bio-banks, officially recognized bodies with a quality system and a set of ethical and legal implications
Data collection

Clinical experimentations:
- For each trial registered in official databases during the year, please indicate:
  - EudraCT code
  - Ethics Committee authorization date
  - type of trial: profit / no profit
  - phase: I / II / III / IV
  - multinational or network trials: yes / no
  - with pediatric patients: yes / no
  - with patients suffering from rare diseases: yes / no

Total number of patients included in the trials registered in the year
- For each study on medical devices in the year, please indicate:
  - Ethics Committee authorization date
  - type of study: profit / no profit
  - notification to the Ministry of Health: yes / no

Total no. of patients included in the studies started in the year
Data collection

Observational studies and empowerment:
- Number of non-interventional/observational studies recorded in the register of the Italian Medicines Agency during the year:
  - no. with pediatric patients:
  - no. with patients suffering from rare diseases:
  - no. with populations at social risk (migrants / poverty, others):
  - total:

Total no. of patients included in the studies registered in the year

- Presence of activities aimed at patient empowerment:
  - courses for expert patients: yes / no
  - participation in trials and studies protocols: yes / no
  - patient registers: yes / no (if yes, please indicate the names)
  - patient associations hosted by the institutions: yes / no (if yes, please indicate the names)
Data collection

Clinical facilities:
- For each biobank, indicate:
  - name
  - website
  - competent body authorization: (document upload)
  - number of participation protocol to BBMRI.it or EU:
  - ELSI membership: yes / no
- Names of the structures (ambulatories, clinics...) serving particular or at risk populations:
- Names of the university veterinary hospitals:
- Does the department provide organizational / administrative support for the conduct of clinical research?
  - no
  - yes, through participation in a clinical trial center (*please indicate name & website*)
  - yes, through a dedicated university office or department / through dedicated personnel
  - (if yes) What kind of support?
    - contracts
    - relations with patients
    - relations with other clinical centers
    - other (*specify)*:
Thanks!

Third Mission Evaluation Unit
brigida.blasi@anvur.it
sandra.romagnosi@anvur.it
The TM Manual

Intellectual Property

a. inventive activity
b. portfolio management
c. exploitation

ability to strategically choose the inventions to be valorized through assignments, licenses, options and spin-out constitutions
The TM Manual

Intellectual Property

Area: Inventive activity

Portfolio management

Exploitation

Criteria

Indicators

Questions

C.1 number of assignments, licenses, options contracts /total number of university patents

C.2 number of spin-out companies using university patents /total number of university patents

C.3 total revenues /total number of university patents
The TM Manual

Intellectual Property

a. inventive activity
b. portfolio management
c. exploitation

AREA
CRITERIA
INDICATORS
QUESTIONS

C.1 number of assignments, licenses, options contracts /total number of university patents
C.2 number of spin-out companies using university patents / total number of university patents
C.3 total revenues /total number of university patents

C.I Has the university developed a policy on intellectual property management and exploitation?
C.II Is the intellectual property portfolio able to attract the interest of the economic system and obtain a flow of revenues?