ANVUR

Meeting of the Advisory Committee of April 15th, 2013

REPORT (ENGLISH Version)

Agenda of the Meeting held on April 15th, 2013 - 15:30 at MIUR:

1. ANVUR Funding
2. Presentation and kick-start of the Working Groups
   - Teaching (AVA) and students
   - Research (VQR) and PhD courses
   - Third Mission (guidance, placement, employability, patents)
   - European Guidelines, Indicators and Ranking (use, efficacy, distortions)
3. Presentation of the online co-work platform
4. AOB

Attendees:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CUN</th>
<th>Gabriele Anzellotti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CNSU</td>
<td>Stefano Lonardi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elisa Ljiljanic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNEL</td>
<td>Ivan Lo Bello (Chairman)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guido Fiegna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mariano Bella</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRUI</td>
<td>Marco Mancini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESU</td>
<td>Leonardo Esposito</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Connected via videoconference:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conferenza Stato-Regioni</th>
<th>Adriana Agrimi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ESU</td>
<td>Fernando Miguel Galan Palomares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Jean Marc Rapp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNSU</td>
<td>Francesco Mattia Sgura</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Absentees (justified):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ERC</th>
<th>Claudio Bordignon</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accademia dei Lincei</td>
<td>Ciro Ciliberto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNEL</td>
<td>Francesca Aulicino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CODAU</td>
<td>Luca Bardi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERC</td>
<td>Giorgio Margaritondo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNR</td>
<td>Luigi Nicolais</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCSE</td>
<td>Dirk Van Damme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Chairman dr. Lo Bello invites to participate to the meeting the ANVUR President, Stefano Fantoni, the members of the ANVUR Board, Massimo Castagnaro and Fiorella Kostoris, the ANVUR
General Director Roberto Torrini, the Manager of the Research Evaluation Area Marco Malgarini and Brigida Blasi of the ANVUR Technical Secretariat. The Advisory Committee ratifies.

The Chairman introduces the work of the Committee, expressing deep appreciation for the great work developed at ANVUR, despite the difficult situation characterized by scarce financial and human resources availability.

Before starting the discussion on the agenda, the President proposes to the CRUI President Marco Mancini to support him as Vice-Chairman to ensure the greatest involvement of the university Rectors in the work of the Committee. Dr. Lo Bello points out that this proposal goes in the direction of the collegiality by valorizing at the same time one of the eminent personalities available in the Advisory Committee.

Various interventions of the present members (Sgura, Fiegna, Anzellotti and Fantoni) follow expressing full share to the Chairman’s proposal.

Prof. Mancini thanks the Chairman and declares his willingness to serve as Vice-Chairman of the ANVUR Advisory Committee, also as a confirmation of the solidarity and sharing of the Rectors in the evaluation processes started.

1. **ANVUR Funding**

In reference to the note on ANVUR regulatory and financial problems, the Chairman points out that the funding has been hitherto uncertain and subject to continuous negotiations. He recalls that in 2012 the Agency has received 2.4 million of funding on the specific MIUR budget chapter, to which have been added, during the year, 2 million from FFO and 1 million from FOE. Only the first entry has a recurrent nature, therefore it is the only one that can be used for the preparation of ANVUR budget and it does not even cover the recurrent costs of the Agency.

The Chairman explains that in 2013 the share of stable funding has been slightly reduced due to the cuts to the State budget. The Ministry has accepted the request for additional resources in order to cover increased costs for the Evaluation of Research Quality (VQR 2004-2010). So, in the FFO were allocated 3.5 million and in the FOE should be made available extra resources. However, this additional funding does not solve the problem of the stable funding mentioned above.

Then Dr. Lo Bello draws the attention on the urgent need to increase the share of stable funding, to enable the Agency to plan its activities. He stresses the importance to give priority to the completion of the personnel plan, as also expected by the Presidential Decree that has established the Agency. This preferably requires an increase in the MIUR budget entry specifically dedicated to the Agency, or alternatively an appropriate legislative measure to make stable the share from FFO and FOE.

After that the Chairman brings to the Committees’ attention two immediate priorities:
- to rapidly increase the funding component having a stable nature to cover the recurrent costs, otherwise it will be impossible to complete the planned personnel plan and deliver the Agency expected output;
- to eliminate the constraint on the number of evaluation experts, otherwise it will be impossible to fulfill the tasks already assigned to the Agency by the subsequent regulatory interventions.

Several interventions of the present members (Mancini, Anzellotti, Fiegna, Esposito, Torrini, Bella) aim at identifying the most effective ways to be taken to ensure the Agency the necessary financial resources and intervene on the definition of their entity.

Prof. Mancini in his speech stresses that additional tasks are required to ANVUR to which it is not linked a financial side to make them feasible.

Also Prof. Anzellotti restates the priority of increasing the share of the stable funding, working on an action on the regulatory constraints of the Agency that are likely to jeopardize the achievement of the institutional objectives.

Dr. Fiegna expresses full agreement on the priority nature of the issue and stresses the importance of moving towards a model of greater financial autonomy to be pursued with an accounting report focused on results. Moreover, in this context it is necessary to pay attention also to ANVUR data management, run by CINECA and paid by the costs assigned by MIUR to the FFO of all the universities. This is a very delicate aspect to which it is necessary to devote adequate resources with the possibility for ANVUR to become direct buyer for the required tasks.

Dr. Esposito expresses uncertainty about the proposal to make stable the share of the FFO for the funding. This might be a solution dictated by the urgency of the moment, but it is not feasible to affect the FFO for the coming years, because numerous cuts have already been made on this entry.

Dr. Torrini expresses deep appreciation for the sharing by the Advisory Committee of the ANVUR funding and personnel problems and stresses that the Presidential Decree 76/2010 sets a limit, not only on the staff, but even on the number of evaluation experts of which the Agency may take advantage. For the specificity of the Agency these experts cannot be considered as consultants but they should be rather considered as work instruments. This constraint may jeopardize the work of ANVUR.

Dr. Bella stresses the need to define a strategic action of the Advisory Committee to support the needs of ANVUR (position paper, letter to the new Minister, etc.).

The Chairman agrees with the need expressed by dr. Bella to define a communication strategy, even more at this complex phase of political balances.

In this regard he stresses the need to strengthen the Parliament’s attention on the evaluation activities and commits himself to meet and discuss these issues with the Chairmen of the Chamber of Deputies and the Senate of the Republic Standing Committees for Culture, Science and Education, and with the Minister of Education, University and Research as well.

Prof. Kostoritis points out that the system of constraints has also prevented the Agency from acquiring offers of support, including financial support, by universities, banking institutions and other bodies.

ANVUR President, Stefano Fantoni, expresses full agreement with the Chairman’s approach and suggests the need for a joint communication strategy.
The CRUI President Marco Mancini expresses some doubts about the positive effects of a Parliamentary lobbying action and rather suggests to advocate a specific legislative measure to overcome the ANVUR financial and personnel problems.

Dr. Agrimi believes that the new 2014-2020 Fund Programme can be an excellent opportunity to properly support the important role of ANVUR.

2. **Presentation and kick-start of the working groups**

The Chairman thanks the Committee members for agreeing to collaborate in a meaningful way to the works of the Advisory Committee, he also thanks those who have expressed their willingness to participate in the Working Groups and invites those who have not yet done so to join in, informing the Secretariat.

Dr. Lo Bello introduces the four Working Groups:

1. Teaching (AVA) and students
2. Research (VQR) and PhD courses
3. Third Mission (guidance, placement, employability, patents)
4. European Guidelines, Indicators and Ranking (use, efficacy, distortions)

He then asks the coordinators of the Working Groups to briefly introduce the subject of each group, prior to work separately.

The interventions of the coordinators of the Working Groups (Fiegna, Anzellotti, Agrimi, Torrini - in the absence of the Group 4 coordinator, Bordignon) aim at better defining the strategic issues and the methodological and content proposals for the work of the groups.

The CRUI President Marco Mancini is willing to follow the work of the Group 1 and 2, respectively devoted to the issues of teaching and research.

Prof. Castagnaro highlights the need for the groups to work in coordination with each other to ensure the unity of the evaluation process of research and teaching.

The Committee ratifies the proposed work programs.

3. **Presentation of the online co-work platform**

Dr. Lo Bello announces to the Advisory Committee members that, starting from May 2013, with the publication of the new ANVUR website, it will be available a document sharing tool to facilitate the activities of the Working Groups and then to launch a subsequent stage of analysis and implementation of a co-work platform also useful for the activities of the Committee Working Groups.

At 18.00, there being no other points for discussion, the plenary meeting is closed.