

**Criteria and guidelines for the selection of the members of the
Evaluation Boards by the AFAM Institutions pursuant to Article 1,
paragraph 304 of Law no. 234/2021**

Approved by resolution of the ANVUR Governing Board no. 29 of 10/02/2022

Foreword

This document sets out the criteria and guidelines for the selection of the members of the Evaluation Boards by the AFAM Institutions, pursuant to Article 1, paragraph 304 of Law 234/2021.

The first paragraph summarises the reference legislation concerning the Evaluation Boards of AFAM Institutions and the tasks entrusted to the Agency by Presidential Decree 132/2003 and Law 234/2021.

In the second paragraph we report the criteria and guidelines for the selection, by the AFAM Institutions, of the members of the Evaluation Boards, defined by ANVUR on the basis of the tasks entrusted to the Boards by the legislation. These criteria were also defined taking into account the steps of AFAM Institutions in adopting the principles set out in the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 2015).¹

1. Legislation references

Article 4(1)(f) of Presidential Decree 132/2003, Regulation laying down criteria for the statutory, regulatory and organisational autonomy of Art and Music Institutions, pursuant to Law no. 508 of 21 December 1999, includes the Evaluation Board among the bodies of AFAM institutions. This body, pursuant to Presidential Decree 132/2003, is appointed for three years and can be confirmed consecutively only once.

With regard to the way in which the Evaluation Board (hereinafter referred to as NUV) is constituted, Article 1, Paragraph 304 of Law 234/2021 recently intervened, repealing what had previously been provided for by Article 1, Paragraph 645 of Law 205/2017, which introduced an important novelty, providing that a fee is paid to the three members (two of whom are external) of the NUV.

“The Evaluation Board referred to in Article 4, paragraph 1, letter f), of the regulation in the Presidential Decree no. 132 of 28 February 2003, is established by resolution of the Administrative Board, after hearing the Academic Council, and is made up of three members with differentiated competences, two of whom are chosen by the institutions among external experts, including foreign ones, in accordance with the criteria and guidelines drawn up by the National Agency for the Evaluation of the University System and Research. The members of the evaluation board are entitled to remuneration from the institutions' own resources, defined by decree of the Minister of Universities and Research, in agreement with the Minister of the Economy and Finance. In Article 1 of Law no. 205 of 27 December 2017, paragraph 645 is repealed”.

The tasks assigned to the Evaluation Boards of AFAM Institutions are punctually indicated by paragraphs 2 and 3 of Article 10 of Presidential Decree 132/2013.

Article 10 - Evaluation Board

1. The Evaluation Board verifies the correspondence of results to objectives. In particular:

- a. is responsible for evaluating the results of teaching and scientific activities and the overall functioning of the institution, verifying, also through comparative cost and performance analyses, the optimal use of resources

¹ https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/esg-2015_it-def.pdf

- b. draws up an annual report on the institution's activities and operations on the basis of general criteria determined by the Committee for the Evaluation of the University System, having consulted the CNAM; the report is sent to the Ministry by 31 March each year and constitutes the reference framework for the Ministry's allocation of financial contributions;
- c. periodically acquires, while maintaining anonymity, the students' opinions on teaching activities, providing an analysis in the Board annual report referred to in point b).

2. The institutions shall ensure that the Evaluation Boards have operational autonomy, the right of access to the necessary data and information, and the publicity and dissemination of the acts in compliance with the legislation protecting confidentiality.

As far as the tasks attributed to the NUVs and ANVUR are concerned, reference should also be made to the provisions of Article 1(644) of Law 205/2017 in which it is stipulated that:

The Evaluation Boards of the institutions of AFAM institutions referred to in Article 1 of Law no. 508 of 21 December 1999, as well as the institutions authorised pursuant to Article 11 of the regulation referred to in Presidential Decree no. 212 of 8 July 2005, shall forward their annual reports on the activities and functioning of the institution, not only to the Ministry of Education, Universities and Research [now Ministry of University and Research, ed.], but also to the National Agency for the Evaluation of the University System and Research (ANVUR), within the same deadlines. ANVUR verifies the adoption, in the reports referred to in the previous sentence, of the general criteria established on the basis of the provisions of Article 10, paragraph 2, letter b), of the regulation referred to in Presidential Decree no. 132 of 28 February 2003, informing the Minister for Education, Universities and Research, within ninety days, of its assessments in this regard.

2. Guidelines and criteria for the Evaluation Boards members

The complex responsibilities of the Boards that emerge from national legislation and European quality assurance guidelines for Higher Education institutions (ESG 2015), as well as the relevance of issues such as teaching quality, attention to students' services, research and artistic production in the AFAM system, more markedly in recent years, internationalisation, digitalisation, organisation, internal effectiveness and efficiency of administrative services and transparency, highlight the need for the members of the Evaluation Boards to have adequate professional skills to assess all these dimensions and to establish a continuous dialogue with the Agency, taking into account the guidance and coordination role assigned to it.

Bearing in mind the need for the three NUV members to possess differentiated competences to cover the different areas of activity required of the body, the individual institutions are called upon to adopt the following general criteria when choosing their members.

For the internal components:

- a) being a tenured lecturer at the AFAM institution for at least two years with proven and qualified teaching and research experience and knowledge of the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG 2015); proven and qualified experience must be assessed with reference to teaching responsibility roles performed in the previous ten years and with respect to the possession of research experience in the artistic field preferably also documented by having participated in collaborative research projects at least at national level or by having obtained awards or prizes at least at national level;
- b) not being a member of other Institution Bodies (with the exception of membership of the Board of Professors) and not be a member of the Evaluation Boards of other AFAM Institutions located in the same Region. In this regard, it is specified that if all the teachers meeting the requirements are members of the Academic Board or if there are no teachers meeting the requirements as per letter a), a teacher belonging to another AFAM Institution must be identified as an internal member;
- c) Experience in teaching and/or research and/or teaching design at an international level is an *advantage*.

With regard to the two external experts, the AFAM Institution must ensure that they possess the appropriate skills to complement the profiles required for the areas of evaluation to be covered by the Board. In this regard, we provide a list of criteria for the selection of the above-mentioned members that each Institution should respect. In particular, the possession of at least two of the following requirements must be ascertained:

- a) having been a member of Evaluation Boards, Independent Evaluation Bodies (OIV), Quality Chairs at Italian higher education institutions for at least three years;
- b) have carried out evaluation activities at ANVUR or European Agencies registered with the ENQA network as a member of evaluation committees of AFAM Institutions or Universities for at least two years;
- c) for teachers of other AFAM Institutions or Universities, possess an artistic or scientific profile consistent with the Institution's subject areas and preferably attested by having participated in collaborative research projects of at least national level;
- d) have worked for at least two years in offices of public administrations, or legally recognised private bodies, or European Quality Assurance Agencies registered with the ENQA network, dealing with internal or external evaluation in areas related to higher education with reference to teaching, research, internationalisation or to planning, management control or performance systems;
- e) hold or have held in the last five years management or high responsibility positions in public or private institutions or companies operating in the artistic-disciplinary sectors of reference of the Institution.

In choosing the members of the Board, the representativeness of both genders must be ensured. Attention is also drawn to the publication on the Institution's website, in the section on the NUV, of the names, institutional e-mail addresses and CVs of the members of the Evaluation Board and the Annual Reports it drawn up.

The role of President of the Evaluation Board is conferred by the Board of Directors and can be assigned to any of the three members.

Each member of the Evaluation Board may participate to a maximum of three AFAM Boards at national level (including non-state institutions recognised by the MUR).

In carrying out the NUV's functions and with regard to all matters concerning the evaluation of teaching and student services, it is recommended that a representative appointed by the Student Council attend the meetings, without voting rights.

Without prejudice to the autonomy of the individual Institutions in proceeding directly to the choice of the NUV members, in compliance with the general criteria indicated above and in order to facilitate the Institutions in the selection process, ANVUR shall set up by June 2022 a special Register of Experts in possession of the above-mentioned requirements, which it will make available to all the interested Institutions, which may draw on it to identify persons with the required competences. As part of the procedures for the selection of members managed autonomously by the individual institutions, the latter are invited to choose the members following specific public notices that ensure maximum transparency and participation of those who meet the requirements.

ANVUR will also promote the realisation of training events for all the members of the Evaluation Boards, in the form of courses, seminars or workshops, also in the framework of the activities foreseen by the Network of the Evaluation Boards of the AFAM Institutions. For the Experts enrolled in the ANVUR Register, the annual permanence of the membership is subject to the participation to at least one training course and to the passing of the required tests.

Lastly, it should be pointed out that the procedures for the composition and selection of the Assessment Boards as set out in these guidelines shall be compulsorily applied to State-owned AFAM Institutions as from the entry into force of the decree of the Minister of Universities and Research, in agreement with the Minister of the Economy and Finance referred to in Article 1, paragraph 304 of Law no. 234/2021, which shall establish the remuneration to be paid to the members of the Boards.