

Follow up Report

First external review 2018-2019

Approved by ANVUR Governing Board on October 27, 2021

Table of contents

Introduction.....	2
ENQA Board recommendations and ANVUR's follow-up	3
Action plan – synoptic table	6
GANTT of activities	21

Introduction

In November 2018 the Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes (ANVUR) underwent its first external review process with the aim of being included in the European Network for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA). The review took place in Rome from 20 November to 22 November 2018 and was coordinated by ENQA: the review panel consisted of 2 ENQA nominees, 1 ESU nominee and 1 EUA nominee.

On 20 June 2019 the panel issued the report *ENQA Agency Review: Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes (ANVUR)*. Globally, the panel considered ANVUR as being compliant with the European Standards and Guidelines, 2015 (ESG).

On 4 July 2019 the ENQA President formally notified ANVUR that “at its meeting of 20 June 2019, the Board of ENQA took the decision to grant ANVUR ENQA membership for five years from that date”. In the same letter, the Board asked for a Follow-up report containing ANVUR’s reactions to all the recommendations within a two-year period.

In order to continue fruitful exchanges with ENQA experts, ANVUR asked for a voluntary Progress visit. This was organised with the ENQA Secretariat and took place on 13 September 2021.

The present Follow-up report was drafted by a working group composed of Professor Antonio Felice Uricchio (President), Professors Marilena Maniaci and Menico Rizzi (Governing Board), Daniele Livon (Director), Alberto Ciolfi and Cecilia Bibbò (Officers); it was then discussed in plenary meetings with the other two members of the Governing Board, Professors Alessandra Celletti and Massimo Tronci, and shared with all the Agency’s staff members, in order to collect their feedback. Preliminary drafts of the report were also presented to the Advisory Board of ANVUR in two meetings held on 13 July and 22 September 2021: this final version includes the feedback received by the Board’s members. A preliminary draft of the report was included in the preparatory documentation of the Progress visit and was used as a basis for discussion with the experts.

The final version of the Follow-up report was discussed and approved by the ANVUR Governing Board in its meeting of 27 October 2021.

ENQA Board recommendations and ANVUR's follow-up

This report presents the recommendations of the ENQA Board and the responses of ANVUR through a number of actions taken since 2019 and planned activities due to be completed before the next external review (2024).

In particular, the Agency is making significant efforts to improve the procedures for the accreditation of institutions and programmes in the AFAM sector (higher education in arts, music, theatre and dance), and to develop specific QA standards, fully compliant with the ESGs. Concrete steps have also been taken to promote participatory assessment, with the greater involvement of students and external stakeholders. Ongoing work concerns the implementation of the ESG in the field of PhD programmes: this objective requires changes to the current legal framework (which should be made shortly) and the adoption of consequent regulations. Consequently, the Progress visit focused mainly on these two topics.

Already in **2019**, immediately after the Agency's accreditation, the Director and the Governing Board, with the support of staff from different areas, analysed the recommendations expressed by the ENQA Board in order to identify possible actions to be taken in following years to bring all the Agency's procedures fully into line with the ESG.

At the end of the analysis, and following internal consultations, specific actions were planned, referring in particular to:

- the revision of Guidelines for the accreditation of new study programs (see the Synoptic Table below);
- the revision of internal regulations;
- optimisation of internal organisation and processes;
- revamping of the Agency's website.

2020 was a very important year for ANVUR. In terms of governance, in January Prof. Antonio Felice Uricchio took over as the new President, and in April four new members of the Governing Board were appointed: Professors Alessandra Celletti, Marilena Maniaci, Menico Rizzi and Massimo Tronci.

A new Advisory Board was also designated in 2020, whose composition is defined by art. 11 of Presidential Decree 76/2010.

In 2020 the COVID-19 pandemic had a strong impact on the daily work of ANVUR, with all staff members having to resort to smart working. Moreover, the emergency had consequences on some

of the Agency's main evaluation procedures, such as the accreditation of institutions and study programmes of Universities and AFAM institutions and the cyclical research assessment procedure (VQR 2015-2019). In particular, site visits were conducted fully online, taking into account the advice provided by ENQA to Quality Assurance Agencies.

With regard to the university sector, all the on-site accreditation visits that had been planned for 2020 were postponed in one semester, resulting in no visits in the first semester of 2020, 11 visits in the second semester and 11 visits in the first semester of 2021. In order to avoid the application of different conditions within the same exercise, the same agenda used for in-presence visits was adopted for those held remotely, and a platform managed by ANVUR staff during the visit was set up to allow the creation of virtual meeting rooms. The first cycle of Institutional accreditation (97 universities) was completed in July 2021.

Regarding the AFAM sector, all site visits planned in 2020 for initial and periodic accreditation of AFAM Institutions and programs were carried out online, following the same agenda of the site visits. The assessment of infrastructures - which for some programmes in particular, represents one of the core aspects of "regular" site visits - was supported by the examination of videos prepared by the Institutions, in addition to a "virtual tour" arranged remotely.

In **2021** the Agency had new challenges to face, with profound changes coming in the economic, cultural, social and environmental spheres, speeded up dramatically by the recent pandemic. New issues were the possible evaluation of e-learning approaches and tools, the assessment of university placement policies and the effectiveness of initiatives in the fields of sustainability and active citizenship.

The publication of ANVUR's Biennial Report on Italy's higher education and research system, due to come out by Spring 2022, will have a very strong bearing on the organization of staff work. The Report will seek to provide policy makers (Academia, Ministry, Parliament and other stakeholders) with timely data, analysis and information (also making comparisons with other countries) to better target higher education and research policies. The publication of the new edition of the Report was put back from 2020 to early 2022 due to the COVID-19 emergency, in order to offer the most up-to-date picture and data, including the impact of the pandemic on Italy's higher education system.

Ongoing work also relates to other aspects of the Agency's activities, among which the revision of initial and periodic accreditation procedures for Universities and study programmes (for which a specific working group has been set up, involving all relevant stakeholders (Ministry representatives, rectors, faculty, students, administrative and technical staff).

Finally, ANVUR plans to re-apply for registration with EQAR in early 2022, after implementing the recommendations made by the Board in the 2019 review report.

Further details on ANVUR's mission, vision and development plans can be found in the 2021-2023 Programme of activities: https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/Programma-delle-attivita-2021_2023-ANVUR.pdf.

Following the notification that ANVUR had been granted ENQA membership for five years, immediate discussions were held, and actions were taken and planned by the Governing Board to address all recommendations through specific actions over the following two years. As regards PhD programmes, the regulatory framework is currently still governed by Decree no. 45/2013 (http://attiministeriali.miur.it/media/211174/dm_regolamento_corsi_dottorato.pdf). The need to update the Decree had already been recognised by ANVUR, and based on the specific recommendations of ENQA, the previous Governing Board had put forward a proposal for a new Decree aimed at regulating Ph.D. programmes in the Italian university system. The new Governing Board decided that the procedure needed further improvements to be fully compliant with ESG 2015. They approved a new proposal that was sent to the MUR (Ministry of Education) at the end of May 2021. The new text contains several novelties and responds in particular to a major recommendation by ENQA, establishing that the accreditation procedures for Ph.D. programmes will have to be defined following the European Standards and Guidelines, 2015 (ESG). At the time of writing, after consultations with major stakeholders (CRUI – Conference of Rectors, CUN – National University Council, ADI – Association of PhD students), a Ministerial Decree based on ANVUR’s proposal will be released by the end of 2021, and could become operational for the next or the following accreditation cycle (2022-23 or 2023-24).

The following pages of this report provide a synoptic table listing all completed, ongoing and planned actions, from 2019 to 2021-22, aimed at fulfilling ENQA’s recommendations. For every action/activity, the following information is provided:

- the relevant Standard;
- the text of the recommendation by the ENQA Board and, where applicable, further comments by the EQAR Board;
- the duration of the activity;
- a brief description;
- documents and/or web pages of reference.

A GANTT chart is added at the end, including all actions/activities presented in the synoptic table, with a reference number to identify them more easily.

Action plan – synoptic table

Note: The reference period is indicated for each action, referred to with a progressive number in the Synoptic Table. The GANTT chart gives details of the implementation of each activity over the years.

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
3.1 Activities, policy and processes for quality assurance	Substantially compliant	3.1 A	<p>It is recommended that ANVUR's Management Team explore ways enabling the increased strategic involvement of the Advisory Board.</p> <p><i>(EQAR also noted that ANVUR should provide a clear description and presentation of its activities on its website, separating activities that fall within and outside the scope of the ESG or within or outside its remit).</i></p>	1	From 2020	<p>The Advisory Board was reelected in 2020 (members are appointed for a 4-year term of office). ANVUR's Governing Board has planned several meetings on specific topics. The Governing Board shared with the Advisory Board the steps taken by the Agency following the ENQA accreditation procedure (request for a progress visit and drafting of the follow-up report) and discussed the draft versions of visit preparation documents before they were sent to the Experts at the end of July.</p> <p>The updated version of the follow-up report was also discussed with the Advisory Board before being approved by the Governing Board.</p>	<p>Advisory Board web page: https://www.anvur.it/anvur/comitato-consultivo/</p> <p>Minutes of the meetings of 13 July 2021 and 22 September 2021, where the draft versions of the follow-up report were discussed</p>
				2	2019	<p>A new page was created on the Agency's website to host the presentation of ANVUR's activities that fall within and outside the scope of the ESG or within or outside its remit.</p>	<p>Website page: https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Typology-of-ANVUR%E2%80%99s-activities.pdf</p>

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
		3.1 B	It is also recommended that the Agency plan a more systematic formal dialogue with specific stakeholders (students, professional organisations, social partners) to collect feedback that is actually of benefit to the	3	2021	After ENQA accreditation, a series of concrete activities was planned by the Governing Board to address all recommendations concerning the assessment and evaluation of PhD programmes within two years. After consultations with major stakeholders (CRUI - Conference of Rectors, CUN - National University Council, ADI - Association of Italian PhD students), ANVUR's proposal for a new PhD regulation will be formalised in a Decree by MUR and become operational by the end of 2021.	Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 113 of 19 May 2021 – Proposal for a new PhD regulation Current PhD regulation, website page: http://attiministeriali.miur.it/media/211174/dm_regolamento_corsi_dottorato.pdf

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
			agency's governance and work.	4	From 2020	Structured meetings with student organizations, Conferences of Directors and Presidents of AFAM Institutions and representatives of the Ministry were organized to discuss the external assessment procedures, for their improvement. Stakeholders were formally involved in the design of new procedures and their implementation. Stakeholders' feedback and observations have been analyzed in depth by ANVUR for the improvement of evaluation processes. Moreover, in July 2021 ANVUR created a Network of Internal Assessment Panels ("Nuclei di Valutazione") of AFAM Institutions. By law, these Panels are composed of evaluation experts belonging not only to the AFAM system but also to external professional organizations and social parts having links with the arts and music. The Network aims to promote the active participation of a broad range of stakeholders in fostering debate around the major issues affecting the AFAM sector. Specifically, the activities of the Panels are designed to foster an exchange of views between them and ANVUR, to encourage the development of QA policies and procedures in the AFAM sector.	Internal documents Link to ANVUR's web page: https://www.anvur.it/anvur/rete-dei-nuclei/nuclei-di-valutazione-afam/
3.3 Independence	Substantially compliant	3.3	It is recommended that ANVUR strive for greater autonomy in setting timetables and defining procedures more freely (particularly AFAM accreditations) for improving the quality and validity of external quality activities	5	From 2019	As from 2019 a structured dialogue has been established between ANVUR and the Ministry of Universities and Research for improving the external accreditation procedures of AFAM Institutions and defining more precisely ANVUR's and MUR's respective roles. The schedule of accreditation activities was modified to guarantee adequate time for external evaluation. The new timetable will be in force from 2022.	Internal notes (AFAM Experts letter; ANVUR note no. 41 of 7 January 2020; ANVUR note no. 4451 of 23 December 2020) Ministerial note no. 1071/2021 (https://www.mur.gov.it/sites/default/files)

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
							/2021-02/Nota%20n.1071%20del%2001-02-2021.pdf)
3.4 Thematic analysis	Substantially compliant	3.4	It is recommended that ANVUR systematically publish any outcomes resulting from single working groups' activities performed by the Agency.	6	From late 2020	<p>On 14 December 2020 ANVUR launched a survey on Distance Learning services provided by universities in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. A working group was asked to develop the survey, in order to analyse the teaching experiences of Italian universities during the pandemic, and to improve strategies that will be adopted once the emergency is overcome.</p> <p>Results are expected to facilitate the adaptation of teaching methods and services for students (in-person and online) to be adopted in the future.</p>	<p>Webpage: https://www.anvur.it/attivita/ava/didattica-a-distanza/</p>

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation	Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
			No.	period	description	
			7	From 2019	Numerous working groups are active within the project TECO - Test sulle competenze, concerning the assessment of students' general and subject-specific learning outcomes. For each participating disciplinary field, a working group including representatives from Academia has been established by ANVUR; information on the composition of the groups and the results of their work are published in a dedicated webpage.	Webpage: https://www.anvur.it/gruppi-di-lavoro/?taxonomy=attivita&term=teco
			8	May 2019 - July 2021	A working group on "Disabilities, Specific Learning Disorders and access to higher education" was established in 2019 with the aim of conducting a survey on services in support of study activities and inclusion for students with disabilities or specific learning disorders. The preliminary results were presented in a workshop held on 4 May 2021; a summary is published on the ANVUR website.	Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 106 of 10 April 2019 - Creation of working group (https://www.anvur.it/gruppo-di-lavoro-ric/disabilita-dsa-e-accesso-alla-formazione-universitaria-2019/) Summary of the survey's results: https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/Risultati-indagine-ANVUR-disabilita-e-DSA.pdf
			9	June 2020- beginning of 2021	A section of the webpage dedicated to the working groups appointed by ANVUR concerns the activities of the International Working Group "Assessment and Quality Assurance of the Higher Education Institutions in the Arts, Music and Dance sectors". Through this webpage, ANVUR sets out to inform the academic community about the appointment, composition, role and activities of this working group, whose support was fundamental for the revision of activities relating to the assessment of AFAM Institutions.	Webpage: https://www.anvur.it/anvur/gruppi-di-lavoro/ https://www.anvur.it/gruppo-di-lavoro-ric/gruppo-di-lavoro-internazionale-valutazione-e-assicurazione-della-qualita-nel-settore-afam-2020-2021/

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
3.5 Resources	Substantially compliant	3.5 A	It is recommended that ANVUR establish priorities with regard to the development of meaningful processes and procedures, compatible with available resources.	10	From 2020	In order to optimize the use of available resources (both in terms of internal staff and external experts enrolled in the Agency's register), a process to rationalise procedures concerning the initial accreditation of new study programmes was carried out, resulting in the publication of new guidelines. As regards periodic accreditation, the existing procedure was not modified in order to ensure application of the same conditions to all Universities within the same accreditation cycle.	Decree 28 January 2021, no. 20
				11	From 2019	10 new permanent resources were recruited between 2019 and 2021 (corresponding to 25% of the previous number of Agency staff members). In addition, since 2019 7 highly skilled non-permanent staff members have been recruited. Finally, the organization of personnel activities has been revamped in order to improve the efficiency of some relevant procedures.	Decree 9 January 2020, no.1; Calls 2/2019, 4/2019, 5/2020, 3/2021, 2/2021
		3.5 B	Furthermore it is recommended that the Agency reflect on possible changes to Agency's organizational structure, including an evaluation – in a medium to long term perspective – about the extent to which reserving a relatively large percentage of	12	From 2019	At the end of 2019, ANVUR started an in-depth internal reflection on its organizational structure, aimed at improving its efficiency. The Director shared a first proposal with the Governing Board in late 2019. After changes to the composition of the Governing Board, the revision of ANVUR's internal organization was set as a priority in the Agency's strategic plan 2021-2023, and this was assigned to the Director as a performance objective for 2021.	ANVUR strategic plan 2021-2023 (pages 18 and 19) https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/Programma-delle-attivit�-2021_2023-ANVUR.pdf ANVUR performance plan 2021-2023 (page 19) https://www.anvur.it/wp-

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
			the budget to the full-time engagement of governing board members would still be considered an optimal use of resources.				content/uploads/2021/02/Piano-della-performance-2021-2023.pdf
		3.5 C	It is recommended that the Agency enhances IT resources for using software applications and providing support to all of the Agency's activities.	13	2019	At the end of 2019 ANVUR became member of CINECA, a not-for-profit Consortium aimed at developing advanced Information Technology applications and services. It is made up of 97 members: the Italian Ministry of Education, the Italian Ministry of Universities and Research, 69 Italian universities and 26 other national public institutions. CINECA is the largest Italian computing centre.	Decree 4 September 2019, no. 216
				14	2020-2021	A brand-new software was designed by ANVUR and implemented by CINECA to manage procedures for the initial and periodic accreditation of Universities and study programmes. The software (an online platform called AVA+) is made available to both expert panels and assessed institutions, and ensures greater efficiency and transparency of the procedure, as well as simpler and more effective monitoring by ANVUR.	Internal working platform

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
				15	April 2020	Considering the complexity of the activities and projects carried out by ANVUR, a migration of the Agency's database to the cloud was carried out during 2020, resulting in an improvement in IT security and a better management of data and resources.	Internal documents
				16	2020-2021	In response to the pandemic, ANVUR decided to adopt a fully virtual approach to institutional visits to universities and AFAM institutions scheduled for the second semester of 2020 and the first semester of 2021. In order to avoid the application of different conditions within the same cycle, the same agenda used for in-presence visits was adopted, and the TEAMS platform (Microsoft Office 365 software) was set up for this purpose, managed by ANVUR's staff during the visit.	Internal documents

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
				17	2020	In 2020 the massive use of “smart working” was resorted to due to the pandemic. A series of initiatives was adopted to improve the Agency's IT resources (such as new IT equipment, applications, digital training of staff). In particular, in order to find out how smart working was carried out during the pandemic, a questionnaire was administered to all employees in January 2021, consisting of questions concerning their level of satisfaction with organizational methods, the tools used and the way in which they experienced smart working in terms of perceived benefits and critical issues. The results allowed the Agency to paint a true picture of the conditions of the new working mode, and they were used to define the Agency's smart working regulations ("POLA - Piano organizzativo del lavoro agile" document).	"POLA" document inside ANVUR's performance plan 2021-2023 (from page 21) https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/Piano-della-performance-2021-2023.pdf

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
3.6 Internal quality assurance and professional conduct	Substantially compliant	3.6	It is recommended that ANVUR introduce a system aimed at formalizing processes ensuring that external feedback is collected systematically and leads to continuous improvements within the Agency.	18	2021	Between October and December 2020 seven HEIs (3 public, 4 private) received their mandatory periodic Institutional and study programme accreditation in full online mode. In order to address the pros and cons of conducting fully online visits, a questionnaire consisting of four open questions was sent in March 2020 to all seven Universities and to the Chairpersons of the CEVs in charge of the visits. Two focus meetings were organized - one with HEI representatives (one person for each HEI) and another with CEV Chairpersons - that allowed participants to discuss with their colleagues and ANVUR representatives the answers given to the questionnaire, to further examine some specific aspects, and to provide suggestions on the possible implementation of the online mode for part (or all) of the agenda of future accreditation visits. The Agency is planning to extend the questionnaire to all the Institutions that have been visited remotely between 2020 and 2021.	Internal document (questionnaire)
				19	From June 2021	A pilot questionnaire was drafted and sent in June 2021 to collect feedback from the panels of experts involved in accreditation procedures. The questions were focused on specific aspects relating to online institutional visits. The Agency is planning to further develop the questionnaire and include it more systematically in the accreditation process, also involving the assessed Institutions. This experimental system to collect feedback will be implemented starting from 2022 in all activities that fall under the scope of the ESG.	Internal document (questionnaire)

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
2.1 Consideration of internal quality assurance	Partially compliant	2.1	It is recommended that ANVUR extend consideration of the internal quality assurance processes described in Part 1 of the ESG to all of the Agency's external QA activities falling within the scope of the ESG.	20	From 2021	The previous Governing Board drew up a proposal to introduce ESG in the PhD accreditation procedure. The new Governing Board decided that the procedure needs further improvements to be compliant with ESG 2015. In the proposal for a new PhD regulation approved by the Governing board on May 19, 2021 and sent to the Ministry, explicit reference is made to the ESG 2015, to which the PhD accreditation procedure will have to refer. After the publication of the new Decree, the Ministry will issue guidelines (based on ANVUR's proposal) that will define a new accreditation procedure in line with the ESG.	Internal documents
				21	2021 2022	The new "Guidelines for the accreditation of new programmes" approved in 2020 state that external evaluation will be based on the internal evaluation Report drafted by the Internal Assessment Panels ("Nuclei di Valutazione") of AFAM Institutions. The international Working Group "Quality Assurance and Evaluation of AFAM Institutions" supported ANVUR in implementing the first draft of the new "Standards and guidelines for the internal assessment of AFAM Institutions" (annual Report of the IAP) in accordance with the ESG. The IAP Network established by ANVUR in July 2021 has proposed a revision of current criteria for the self-evaluation of AFAM Institutions. These modifications collected by ANVUR were presented during the second meeting of the IAP Network (October 5, 2021). An advanced version of the new criteria and of the guidelines will be discussed in the November 2021 meeting and then sent to AFAM stakeholders and the Ministry for further review. The new guidelines will be	<p>Guidelines for accreditation of new first cycle diploma (https://www.anvur.it/attivita/afam/valutazione-corsi-i-livello-afam/); Guidelines for accreditation of new second cycle diploma (https://www.anvur.it/attivita/afam/valutazione-corsi-ii-livello-afam/).</p> <p>Webpage of the Network of the IAPs of the AFAM Institutions: https://www.anvur.it/anvur/rete-dei-nuclei/nuclei-di-valutazione-afam/</p>

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
						approved by the ANVUR Governing Board by the end of 2021 and will be in force for the 2022 Report or 2023 Report.	
2.2 Designing methodologies fit for purpose	Substantially compliant	2.2 A	It is recommended that ANVUR continue efforts to ensure the formal and concrete systematic involvement of student organizations – and the student body in general – in the design and enhancement of its activities.	22	From 2019	As a public body, ANVUR participates in the national "participatory evaluation" initiative, promoted by the Public Administration Department to provide public administrations with methodological guidelines to encourage the participation of citizens and users in the evaluation of organizational performance. Following this initiative, student organizations have been concretely involved in ANVUR's activities.	Guidelines by the Public Administration Department: https://performance.gov.it/system/files/LineeGuidaeRifNorm/LG_Valutazione_partecipativa_28-11.pdf
				23	From 2019	ANVUR has continued its efforts to involve student organizations in its activities. For the University system, the most relevant case was the official inclusion of the National University students' representative body (CNSU) in the working group for the revision of ANVUR Guidelines for the periodic accreditation of Universities and study programmes (AVA system).	Internal document
		2.2 B	Furthermore, it is recommended that the Agency further involve AFAM stakeholders in the design and continuous improvement of	24	2021-2022	A fruitful dialogue has been established with AFAM stakeholders, including student organizations. They are institutionally involved in discussions about new procedures or future activities related to the evaluation of AFAM Institutions. They formally participated in the definition of both Guidelines	Internal documents Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 61 of 11 March 2021 - Guidelines for accreditation of new first cycle diploma

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
			the Agency's external QA activities in the AFAM sector.			for the accreditation of new programs (first and second cycle diplomas) approved in 2021.	https://www.anvur.it/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Linee-Guida-AFAM_I-livello-Ampliamento.pdf Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 6 of 11 March 2021 - Guidelines for accreditation of new second cycle diploma (https://www.anvur.it/attivita/afam/valutazione-corsi-ii-livello-afam/).
2.3 Implementing processes	Substantially compliant	2.3	It is recommended that ANVUR increase the usefulness of the AFAM accreditation system, implementing processes compatible with the AVA system and adapted to the AFAM institutional context	25	2021 2022	In keeping with the accreditation procedure for new University study programmes, the new "Guidelines for the accreditation of AFAM programmes", approved in 2020, stated that the external evaluation will be based on the internal evaluation Report drawn up by the Internal Assessment Panels (IAP) of AFAM Institutions.	Guidelines for accreditation of new first cycle diploma (https://www.anvur.it/attivita/afam/valutazione-corsi-i-livello-afam/); Guidelines for accreditation of new second cycle diploma (https://www.anvur.it/attivita/afam/valutazione-corsi-ii-livello-afam/).
2.4 Peer-review experts	Partially compliant	2.4	It is recommended that ANVUR involve student evaluators in all external quality assurance activities. <i>(EQAR also noted that if student evaluators have an equal role in panels there are</i>	26	2021 2022	In 2021 ANVUR revised the structure of the Register of Experts for the accreditation of AFAM Institutions and Programmes. A "student evaluator" profile was included in the Register; students will consequently be systematically involved in the accreditation of new programmes and Institutions starting from 2021 (panels that include students have already been nominated).	Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 54 of 4 March 2021 Call for AFAM experts 6/2021: https://www.anvur.it/bando-avviso/avviso-n-6-2021-procedura-per-le-candidature-allinserimento-nellaalbo-degli-esperti-della-valutazione-iniziale-e-periodica-dei-corsi-e-delle-istituzioni-dellalta-formazione/

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
			<i>no grounds for paying them less. EQAR further underlined that the lack of involvement of student experts in ANVUR's other activities is a matter of concern).</i>	27	From October 2020	<p>Student evaluators were included in the procedure of initial accreditation of new universities (two rounds of initial accreditation took place in late 2020 and early 2021).</p> <p>Starting from academic year 2021/2022, student evaluators will be included in the procedures of initial accreditation of new study courses</p>	<p>Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 207 of 15 October 2020</p> <p>Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 225 of 21 October 2021</p>
2.6 Reporting	Partially compliant	2.6	<p>It is recommended that ANVUR publish full reports by the experts that are not only clear and accessible to the academic community, but also to external partners and other interested individuals.</p> <p><i>(EQAR underlined that, since the publication of summary reports in the case of AVA system evaluations, (...) ANVUR complies partially with the standard, and it is not non-compliant.)</i></p>	28	Planned 2022	<p>ANVUR is currently completing the first cycle of periodic accreditation procedures for Universities. In order to avoid the application of different conditions within the same exercise, for the final group of universities too summary reports (and not the full reports written by the Experts) will be published on the Agency's website. Starting from 2022, ANVUR will require the publication of full reports for each procedure, for Universities as well as for AFAM Institutions.</p>	<p>To be included in the guidelines resulting from the working group for the "revision of ANVUR Guidelines for the periodic accreditation of Universities and study programmes" (AVA system).</p>
2.7 Complaints and appeals	Substantially compliant	2.7	<p>It is recommended that ANVUR make more transparent and accessible existing internal mechanisms, the actors involved and the detailed procedures of both complaints</p>	29	March 2020 - 2021	<p>Following an analysis of the procedures adopted by other Agencies and taking into account the recommendations from EQAR and the external Review report of ANVUR by ENQA, the previous Governing Board approved the establishment of a Complaints Committee, called "Comitato di Garanzia", and of a procedure for handling appeals. The new Governing Board</p>	<p>Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 40 of 3 March 2020; Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 150 of 14 July 2021</p> <p>Resolution of ANVUR Governing Board no. 230 of 27 October 2021</p>

ESG Standard	Compliance according to REVIEW REPORT	ENQA BOARD Recommendation		Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities			Documents
				No.	period	description	
			<p>and appeals, respectively against procedural issues and all decisions.</p> <p><i>(EQAR underlined the lack of impartial processes for handling appeals, as the appeals are considered by the same body (the Governing Board) making all decisions relating to ANVUR's accreditation procedures. EQAR further noted the lack of a transparent and formal procedure to handle complaints).</i></p>			<p>decided that the procedure needs further improvements to be fully compliant with ESG 2015, and they prepared a new proposal that was discussed with ENQA Experts during the progress visit.</p> <p>The establishment of the "Comitato di Garanzia", the definition of its duties and the procedures for handling complaints were approved by the Governing Board in October 2021, taking into account the experts' suggestions. A detailed description of the new procedures will be also prepared, communicated to higher education institutions and published on ANVUR website.</p>	

Actions taken - Ongoing/planned activities*		2019				2020								2021								2022																				
		9	10	11	12	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
23	Inclusion of the National University Students' representative body (CNSU) in the working group for the revision of ANVUR Guidelines for the periodic accreditation of Universities and study programmes																																									
24	Establishment of structured meetings with AFAM stakeholders for the enhancement of assessment procedures. Definition of new guidelines, in collaboration with stakeholders, that take into consideration the specific needs and features of AFAM Institutions																																									
25	Inclusion of the internal evaluation Report drafted by the Internal Assessment Panels (IAP) of AFAM Institutions in the external assessment processes, in line with the accreditation procedure in place for the University sector																																									
26	Design and implementation of the new structure of the Register of AFAM Experts for the formal inclusion of students in ANVUR Commissions (CEV-AFAM)																																									
27	Inclusion of student evaluators in the procedure for the initial accreditation of new universities and new study courses																																									
28	Publication of full reports of QA activities																																									
29	Establishment of a Complaints Committee and definition of a new procedure for handling complaints and appeals																																									